

# NEWSLETTER

of

## The American Handel Society

---

Volume VI, Number 3

December, 1991

---

### The Malmesbury Collection

The thirty-six elegantly-bound volumes of manuscript copies of Handel's works now owned by the sixth Earl of Malmesbury have been recognized for some time as an important musical source for the music they contain. They constitute the main part of a collection originally copied for Elizabeth Legh; two other volumes from her collection are at the Bodleian Library, Oxford. Elizabeth Legh died in 1734, and the Earl of Malmesbury's collection includes a virtually complete run of copies of Handel's London operas to that date, plus *Esther*, *Acis and Galatea*, the "Brookes" Passion, the "Chandos" Te Deum, the "Utrecht" Te Deum and Jubilate, the *Birthday Ode for Queen Anne*, and a number of miscellaneous volumes of instrumental music. Many of the opera copies date from periods very close to the first performances, and preserve versions of the works as they stood at the time. The copy of *Acis and Galatea* appears to be derived from a lost conducting score of the "Cannons" version, and contains some important practical information. For many works, vocal and instrumental, the volumes of the collection provide important - sometimes even unique - sources for particular movements.

Although the Earl of Malmesbury is, by his own admission, "totally unmusical," he has tried as far as possible to provide access and hospitality for visitors wishing to consult his collection, but there have been practical limitations which have inevitably proved rather frustrating occasionally to editors requiring extended access to the copies, or foreign visitors with a crowded short-term schedule in Britain. During 1990, the earl agreed to the filming of the collection under the auspices of the Hampshire Archives Trust, and this has now been completed on 35 millimeter microfilm. Volume contents have been filmed in black-and-white, and the volume bindings have been recorded on color film. Copies of the films will not be freely available, but a copy has been deposited at the Hampshire Record Office, and can be consulted there by prior arrangement. So consultation of the Malmesbury Collection will still require a trip to Britain, but with greatly improved opportunities for access during the regular opening hours of the record office. The record office, in Winchester, is at present



Paul Henry Lang  
1901-1991

The following remarks are personal reflections on Paul Henry Lang by J. Merrill Knapp that were read at the opening of the 1991 meeting of the American Handel Society on November 1, 1991 in Washington, D.C.

Some fifty-two years ago, this newly-embarked and very embryonic musicologist joined Professor Paul Henry Lang's seminar in the journalism building at Columbia University. I was a late arrival because I had not majored in music at college (there was no department then at Yale), and I had spent the previous year just catching up on theory and history courses which were a background necessity for a career as a college teacher.

I'll never forget those initial months. Where was the outline for a curriculum? Where was the structure for lectures or topics? What was this fascinating, witty, and

## The American Handel Society 1992 Research Fellowship

The Directors of the American Handel Society invite applications for the 1992 American Handel Society Research Fellowship, an award of \$1,500 to be granted to an advanced graduate student pursuing research on Handel or related fields. This fellowship may be used on its own or to augment other grants or fellowships. The fellowship recognizes work in the area of Handel studies, as well as work on Handel's contemporaries in music or theater, or more general studies of operatic or theatrical traditions. The winner of the award is given the opportunity to speak at the annual meeting of the American Handel Society.

Applicants must be currently studying at a North American university and must submit a resume, a description of the project for which the fellowship will be used (not to exceed 750 words), and a budget showing how and when the applicant plans to use the funds. In addition, applicants must have two letters of recommendation sent directly to the society at the address below.

Applications for the 1992 fellowship must be postmarked no later than April 15, 1992, and should be sent to AHS Fellowship Committee, c/o Ellen T. Harris, 10-200 Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02139. Applicants will be notified of the committee's decision by May 15.

## The American Handel Society 1992 Annual Meeting

The American Handel Society will hold its 1992 Annual Meeting and Conference on Friday, October 30 through Sunday, November 1 in the Washington D. C. area. The conference sessions will focus on the topic "Representations of Classical Antiquity in the First Half of the Eighteenth Century." The Society welcomes proposals for papers pertaining to but not restricted to the central topic.

Applicants should submit a paper proposal of not more than 500 words in four copies to AHS Program Committee, Lowell E. Lindgren, Chairman, The American Handel Society, 14N-216, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, MA 02139. The abstracts of papers read at the conference will be published in the December 1992 American Handel Society Newsletter and should be submitted in publishable form. Proposals must be postmarked no later than April 1, 1992; applicants will be notified of the committee's decision by May 15.

The program committee for the 1992 meeting will consist of Lowell E. Lindgren, Massachusetts Institute of Technology (chair), Eleanor Selfridge-Field, Center for Computer Assisted Research in the Humanities, and Philip Brett, University of California, Riverside.

Lang from page 1

learned man trying to do for us with his wide-ranging thoughts and remarks on everything from Machaut to Mozart and beyond? When we had questions or puzzlement, he would largely say: "Go and look it up for yourself. These are the relevant books and articles." Occasionally there would be a student paper read and some following discussion on an assigned topic, but mostly there was utter license and jumping around from soup to nuts. Yet I survived and learned a lot from his telling rejoinders and his European method.

As the years went by and I managed to gain the friendship of this man, I admired more and more his willingness to tackle big issues in music, whether it was wide-ranging statements in *Music and Western Civilization*, a telling remark in the *Herald Tribune*, or, with my own interest, his biography of Handel. It was dangerous but so refreshing when most of us were mired down in medieval manuscripts, an unknown Baroque composer, or the Mannheim school (important as these may be) to reread his fluent paragraphs (in elegant English learned as a second or third language) and to find them stimulating and filled with ideas that needed more investigation.

I remember picking on him for some minor point in his Handel biography which was not footnoted or given a source, but he knew what it was and recalled it correctly from his capacious memory.

Paul has gone from us after a very full and wonderful life with Anne, his children, and many colleagues who admired him. It ranged from Budapest ("I'm only an ex-bassoon player," he used to say) to Berlin, to Paris, to Poughkeepsie, to Columbia and other distant places, but he gave of himself freely to students, friends, and even acquaintances who pursued him with foolish correspondence.

We shall miss him to no end, but are grateful to have had his presence for so many years, and can thoroughly rejoice in what he was able to give us.

J. Merrill Knapp

## Mark W. Stahura Recipient of the American Musicological Society Paul A. Pisk Prize

Mark W. Stahura received the first Paul A. Pisk prize for his paper "Refuting the *Ripieno* in Handel's Orchestra," delivered at the 1991 Annual Meeting of the American Musicological Society in Chicago, Illinois. The Pisk prize is awarded to the outstanding graduate-student paper of the meeting, and carries with it a stipend of \$1,000.

Mark W. Stahura is currently completing a doctoral dissertation at the University of Chicago on Handel's orchestration.

## Abstracts of the 1991 American Handel Society Conference

The 1991 American Handel Society Conference was held in conjunction with the American Bach Society on November 2 in Washington, D. C. Through the kindness of Philip H. Highfill, conference sessions were held at the Gelman library of George Washington University. Program chairman Lowell E. Lindgren and Newsletter editor C. Steven LaRue edited the abstracts.

Paper Session I: Audiences and Formal Developments;  
Marita McClymonds, Chair.

### On the Education of Handel's Audience

Richard G. King, Stanford University

In my dissertation, "The Composition and Reception of Handel's *Alessandro*," I have suggested that an important part of the meaning of Handel's opera can be deciphered with an understanding of eighteenth-century historical thought, and that a guide to this thought is the education of Handel and his contemporaries. Ancient history formed a significant part of the curriculum, and it is important to know what was read. But more importantly, we must understand *how* these materials were read. A key to this understanding is the "commonplace book." From the end of the fourteenth century, students were taught to collect materials from history, fable and other sources in commonplace books (essentially notebooks) for use as examples in disputation and, eventually, everyday conversation. The extracts (phrases, illustrations of themes and so forth) were memorized, and this shaped the thought of students, who came to think of history in terms of *exempla* (for example, certain particularly illuminating episodes from the lives of historical characters).

In this paper I outline the typical education of a London opera audience member. It appears that many in the audience studied Italian, and there are a number of other sources which also suggest that the language was more widely understood than has been acknowledged to this point. Following an examination of surviving commonplace books of Handel's contemporaries, I then turn to various representations of history in visual art, literature and opera to see how other artists expressed the heroic image, and how this expression was received in other contexts.

Terry Eagleton has suggested that "every literary text is built out of a sense of its potential audience, includes an image of who it is written for . . ." This is no less true of Handel than of any other artist, and it certainly applies to his operas. It is no accident that the majority of Handel's operas are heroic, the subject matter drawn from well-known sources of ancient history. The arrangement of these sources is also no acci-

dent, for a parallel can be drawn between the manner in which ancient history was studied and the way it was represented: the *exempla* of the commonplace book took visible form on the stage.

[Slides illustrated the custom of following the printed text during performances.]

At the end of the second paper reading session, Carole Taylor provided an impromptu response to Richard King's paper in which she emphasized and elaborated upon the validity of King's points about the student-pupil relationship between Handel and Princess Anne, and Anne's support of the second Royal Academy opera company.

### The Allegorical Use of Remote Tonalities in Bach's Arias and its Impact on His Audiences

Stephen A. Crist, Emory University

This paper examines the use of remote tonalities to represent the meaning of textual concepts in the arias of J.S. Bach. Although quite diverse in scoring, melodic invention, and form, the vast majority of Bach's arias do not venture beyond what Heinichen called the "ambitus" of the five most closely related keys. When an aria does modulate beyond one accidental in either direction, the reason is almost always connected with the allegorical representation of a specific theological concept or other idea.

Remote keys in the Bach arias generally occur in connection with ascending and descending patterns called, respectively, *anabasis* and *catabasis*. These patterns are used in two basic ways. On the one hand, the ascent or descent can involve stepwise root movement. The other main approach is through the arrangement of major and minor keys in the circle of fifths (Heinichen's "Musicalischer Circul"). From this point of view, movement in the sharpward direction constitutes "ascent," while movement towards an increasing number of flats represents "descent," regardless of whether the specific pitches are literally higher or lower.

In addition to discussing several examples of these procedures, the paper considers the extent to which allegorical uses of tonality are aurally perceptible. Although other compositional techniques which operate closer to the musical surface doubtless were readily apprehended by worshippers in Leipzig, modulations to remote keys belong among the sonic occurrences which, in the words of Arnold Schering, "cannot be fully understood on a single and first hearing, even with the keenest ears and utmost intelligence, but which require repetition and probably even study."

[A seven-page handout provided examples from seven cantatas: BWV 13/5, 48/6, 91/5, 109/3, 151/3, 164/1, and 179/5.]

## Handel, Haydn, and the Expansion of the Binary Dance Form

C. Steven LaRue, Chicago, Illinois

Handel's frequent expansion of small, binary forms in many of the concertos from his Op. 6 demonstrates some principles of formal organization found in sonata form structures associated with the classical style of the second half of the eighteenth century. More important than Handel's "anticipation" of later formal principles, however, is the fact that he created large instrumental movements based on harmonic schemes in which the juxtaposition of key areas, such as that of the tonic and dominant found in typical binary dance forms, could be expanded and elaborated upon. While the expansion of the overall dimensions of a small piece by means of extending both the transition to and establishment of secondary key areas as well as the return to the tonic is frequently found in the binary movements of the concertos in Op. 6 (most obviously in the Polonaise of no. 3), Handel's interest in this technique as a means of large-scale formal organization can be found in non-binary movements as well.

Undoubtedly the most subtle use of expanding a small, binary form into a much larger piece is found in the first movement of concerto no. 2, a movement which at first does not appear to bear any resemblance to the binary piece upon which it is based. Closer examination, however, reveals that a simple minuet of four phrases with the typical harmonic structure (I-I, I-V : | | : V-V, I-I) has been expanded by extending the establishment of V at the end of the second phrase, and by creating an extension of V, an excursion involving brief arrivals on other keys, and a transition back to I between the third and last phrases of the minuet. In both of these expansions, new material has been introduced, a point highlighted by the fact that the minuet theme is in three-eighth and the new material is in common-time.

The structure of this movement seems clearly to demonstrate Handel's experimentation with expanding a small, binary dance movement into a much larger composition. Such techniques are in fact discussed by theorists later in the century. Heinrich Christoph Koch, for example, discusses how binary movements can be expanded into much larger pieces in his *Versuch einer Anleitung zur Composition* (Leipzig, 1782-93), and many of the techniques Koch describes have been shown by Elaine R. Sisman to be present in a number of Haydn's works ("Small and Expanded Forms: Koch's Model and Haydn's Music," *Musical Quarterly* 48 [1983]). Like Handel, Haydn seems to have used the techniques of expansion by inserting new material between the phrases of a simple binary movement in the composition of the second movement of his symphony no. 45 ("Farewell"). Rather than representing the techniques of a specific era of instrumental composition, therefore, the first movement of Handel's Op. 6, no. 2 concerto demonstrates an approach to the composition of instrumental music that

remained in use throughout the eighteenth century, and that played a significant role in the development of the large-scale, highly sophisticated structures found in the works of many classical composers.

[A seven-page handout provided examples from Koch's *Versuch*, Handel's Op. 2, no. 2, I, and Haydn's symphony no. 45, II together with "reconstructions" of the binary forms upon which the Handel and Haydn movements are hypothetically based.]

A response to C. Steven LaRue's paper by Channan Willner emphasized both the similarities and the differences between Handel's and Haydn's approaches to compositional problems by means of numerous Schenkerian diagrams. Willner's Schenkerian analysis of the first few measures of Handel's Op. 6, no. 2, I provided rhythmic and harmonic arguments against LaRue's triple time interpretation of the tutti theme. In addition, Willner suggested motivic links between the various sections of Handel's Op. 6, no. 2, I. Willner's extensive examples will be included in his Ph. D. dissertation, "The Articulation of Form and Rhythm in Handel's Instrumental Music" (City University of New York), currently in progress.

## Bach, Handel, and the Recapitulation Aria

Miriam K. Whaples,  
University of Massachusetts, Amherst

This study is a continuation of two earlier ones ("Bach's Earliest Arias," *Journal of the Riemenschneider Bach Institute* 20 [1989]; "Bach's Recapitulation Arias," forthcoming) which interpret the so-called "free da capo" aria form of Bach as a true recapitulation form in the Classical sense (recapitulation as harmonic reinterpretation and resolution of originally non-tonic material). The form is an ABA' in which A and B end in non-tonic perfect cadences. The very sparse and brief references in the literature to this aspect of the form (E.T. Cone, "On the Structure of *Ich folge dir*," *College Music Symposium* V [1965]; Malcolm Boyd, *Bach*, London, 1983) look forward to its relation to the sonata, a problematical matter which remains to be investigated. Its relation to the prevalent aria forms of its own day appears to be no less problematical. Although the form represents more than a quarter of all of Bach's arias, it does not occur (so far as I have found) in the music of any of his circle of colleagues in Germany, or in Italian opera.

The progenitors of the form seem to be a handful of rather primitive arias in Mattheson's *Cleopatra* (1703), Handel's *Almira* (1705), and Bach's "Hunt" Cantata ("Was mir behagt," 1713). Since Bach is known to have been familiar with *Almira*, it is possible (but not provable) that he picked up the idea from the Hamburg examples, most of which (like the two in the "Hunt" Cantata) end with no more than motto-rounding rather than complete recapitulations. By 1714, Bach's arias

show the recapitulation in its complete form (BWV 182/4); within the Weimar period, he had already experimented with transposition and paraphrase in the tonic of material originally in the dominant (BWV 80a/3, 31/4) and with the completely transposed subdominant recapitulation (BWV 23/1), neither of which procedures was to appear frequently in the Leipzig arias.

Although Handel adopted the recapitulation aria in its infancy, after Hamburg he did not return to it until "Rejoice greatly" in *Messiah* (1741), where it resulted from the revision and abridgement of a da capo aria: the "B" section was placed between A1 and A2, and the da capo eliminated. Significantly, A2 was altered to begin like A1. There are only a handful of similar arias in the oratorios after *Messiah*, but some recapitulation techniques are found in his aria in the parallel ("häftig") form A B AB (cultivated also by Bach), and in the A A (cavatina) form, the binary design - derived directly from the da capo aria - which was to play an important historical role in the evolution of sonata form (the cavatina does not appear among Bach's arias). Handel's basic orientation to da capo form is also seen in about thirty oratorio arias with true modified da capos, i. e. tonic closure of the first A section.

If we compare Bach's and Handel's recapitulation arias as forms, Bach's more clearly approximate the sonata idea. On the other hand, since sonata was at least as much a matter of style as of form, Handel's approaches to the galant style bring his arias toward the Classical style from a different direction than Bach's.

[A handout provided formal diagrams for Bach's BWV 245/13, Mattheson's "Leset, ihr Augen," and Handel's "Scepter und Kron" (*Almira*), "Thou art gone up on high" (first version; *Messiah*), "Why does the God of Israel sleep?" (*Samson*), and "Ye swift minutes as he fly" (*Alceste*).]

A response to Miriam K. Whaples's paper by David Ross Hurley emphasized the anachronistic approach of Whaples paper, particularly in terms of the use of late eighteenth-century sonata form as manifested in instrumental music as a model. Hurley's argument was based on examples from the mid eighteenth-century Italian opera seria and on the variety of da capo based forms that existed throughout the century, particularly the modified da capo, which essentially places the B section between the A1 and A2 parts of the A section of a typical da capo aria (a technique that Handel employed in the composition of "O sacred oracles" from *Belshazzar*).

## Paper Session II:

Classical Consequences; Rachel Wade, Chair.

### Affective Uses of the "stil galant" in the Late Works of J. S. Bach and Handel

Kenneth Nott, University of Hartford

During the last decades of their composing careers, J. S. Bach and G. F. Handel appropriated elements of the new Italian pre-classic style and used them frequently - more frequently than some historians have been willing to admit. This stylistic appropriation added a dimension of lightness, even youthfulness, to many of their late works, including some of their most profound and ambitious masterpieces. This new dimension is especially evident when it comes to what theoreticians of the day saw as one of the composer's primary functions, namely, expressing in musical terms the affections or passions of the soul.

In the case of Bach, the *galant* style became, somewhat unexpectedly, another way of expressing joyful praise, especially in contexts where the idea of "newness" plays an important role. Movements from two late works illustrate this point. "Rühmet Gottes Güte und Treu," the bass aria from wedding cantata BWV 195, is written in a style strongly resembling that of Bach's Dresden contemporary, Johann Adolph Hasse. Clues to Bach's purpose in using the modern style may be found in the texts of the aria and in the recitative which precedes it. Words like "rühmet," "preiset," and "Freunde" are expressive of an affect which may be called joyful praise. This would be in keeping with the description of the *galant* style which Bach's one-time pupil, Kirnberger, furnished for Sulzer's *Allgemeine Theorie der schönen Künste* (vol. 3, p. 378). The frequent occurrence in the aria and recitative texts of the word "neu," so appropriate for a wedding celebration, may have also suggested to Bach the use of what Lorenz Mizler called "neuesten Geschmack," or the "newest taste" in music. Joyful praise and newness combine in another late Bach work in *galant* style, namely, the thirteenth Versus of his arrangement of the Pergolesi *Stabat Mater*.

Understanding Handel's use of the *stil galant* has been hindered by much twentieth century critical writing. Commentators such as Dent, Dean, and Herbage consistently dismiss the *galant* numbers as un-Handelian or musically inferior. A reexamination of these pieces suggests that Handel used the modern style as a means of portraying certain character types. The oratorios *Theodora* and *Jephtha* yield several instances: a weak Roman officer (Septimius) incapable of effective action, a character (Jephtha) who unknowingly sets in motion a series of tragic events, and a pair of young lovers (Iphis and Hamor). In each portrayal, Handel shows that rather than desperately trying to keep up with the taste of the day, as Dent claimed, he accepted the new style for

what it was - light, young, fresh, playful - and used it imaginatively and with a sense of dramatic rightness.

[A six-page handout provided examples from Bach's arrangement of Pergolesi (BWV 195/2-3), "D'ogni amator la fede" from Hasse's *Siroe*, "Though the honours" from Handel's *Theodora*, and "Virtue my soul shall still embrace" and "These labours past" from Handel's *Jephtha*.]

Handel, Bach, and One Eighteenth -Century  
Listener: C. P. E. Bach

David Schulenberg, Cambridge, Massachusetts

Handel's music and his posthumous reputation were a constant presence at Hamburg during C. P. E. Bach's service there as cantor and director of church music (1768-88). Thus, when Burney published his *Account* of the 1784 Handel Commemoration at London, containing a deprecating reference to J. S. Bach's organ fugues, C. P. E. Bach was, as Dragan Plamenac has shown (*Musical Quarterly* [1949]: 565), the probable author of an anonymous reply. In fact, this reply was the climax of a lifelong series of exchanges in which C. P. E. Bach was apparently involved, directly or indirectly, in correcting inaccurate statements about his father and unfair comparisons of the latter with Handel. Earlier instances include the pseudonymous reply by "Caspar Dunkelfiend" (*Gedanken eines Liebhabers der Tonkunst*, 1755) to Nichelmann's 1755 treatise on melody, and the autobiography of C. P. E. Bach inserted in place of Burney's original account in the German edition of the latter's *Tours*.

C. P. E. Bach's unadmiring view of Handel's keyboard music may have been adversely colored by an inauthentic version of the fugue from the flute sonata HWV 367b, published as a keyboard piece in a 1762 Berlin anthology. C. P. E. Bach nevertheless admired Handel's later vocal works, and may have adopted from them certain dramatic types of text-setting not found in his father's music. Examples include the insertion of chorale quotations into free choruses (as in Handel's Funeral Anthem and in a chorus from Bach's Passion Cantata H. 776, praised by Burney) and the quasi-Romantic use of mysterious sustained chords for the opening of the Sanctus text (as in Handel's Utrecht Te Deum and Bach's *Heilig* H. 778).

C. P. E. Bach may also have taken Handel's London concerts as the model for his public performances at Hamburg, which included charitable presentations of *Messiah* and possibly other Handel works. Bach's oratorio performances, like Handel's, included his own keyboard concertos and solos. One special concert program, performed in 1786, consisted of the Credo from J. S. Bach's B Minor Mass, "I know that my Redeemer liveth" and the "Hallelujah" chorus from Handel's

*Messiah*, as well as three of C. P. E. Bach's own works. The concert evidently reflected Bach's concern for the proper evaluation of different composers and their styles, as noted in a letter that he wrote in 1786 to J. J. Eschenburg (translator of Burney's *Account*). Thus the concert may have been conceived as an answer to the 1784 and 1785 Handel commemorations in London; it publicly juxtaposed works by J. S. Bach and Handel (probably for the first time) while also implicitly making a claim for C. P. E. Bach as a worthy successor to both composers.

[A four-page handout listed the works of Handel known or probably known to C. P. E. Bach and provided examples from the fifth movement of Handel's Sonata, HWV 367b (Op. 1, no. 9), "She delivered the poor" from his Funeral Anthem, HWV 264, "To thee all angels cry" from his Utrecht Te Deum, HWV 278, "Fürwahr, er trug" from C. P. E. Bach's Passion Cantata, H. 776, "O Tod, wo ist dein Stachel?" from his *Auferstehung*, H. 777, the Chorus of the angels and the people from his *Heilig*, H. 778, and fugue subjects from "And with his stripes" from Handel's *Messiah* and the "Amen" from C. P. E. Bach's Magnificat, H. 772.]

Handel Redux: Mozart's Arrangement of *Messiah*

David Schildkret, University of Rochester

Paul Henry Lang says of Mozart's Handel arrangements: "Mozart's version of Handel is like Pope's translation of Homer; an excellent work without being a good translation." Of the four Handel works Mozart arranged between 1788 and 1790 for private performances organized by Gottfried van Swieten, the *Messiah* arrangement is probably the most troublesome to Handelianists. What are the problems of this translation? Do the composers really speak different languages? Why was it necessary to arrange *Messiah*, and was the result a distortion or, as Lang says earlier in his essay, "something brilliant and worthwhile?"

Mozart's changes fall roughly into three categories: 1) cuts and substitutions, 2) changes of orchestration, and 3) addition and alteration of performance indications. In addition, unrecorded alterations arose from changes in the interpretation of musical notation during the half-century between the composition of *Messiah* and Mozart's arrangement of it. Furthermore, additional variants were the result of mistakes of ambiguities in the source from which Mozart worked, van Swieten's copy of the first edition, printed in 1767 by Randall and Abell.

A principal ambiguity of the Randall and Abell score concerns the choice of soloists; Mozart here works not as a translator but as a creator, making decisions according to his own criteria. His cutting and trimming of movements shortens the works and propels it more



rapidly to a conclusion. In keeping with the sound-ideal of his time, Mozart varies the color of the orchestration by the addition of woodwinds and brass in a remarkable array of combinations. Not only the presence of the instruments of a standard Classical period orchestra, but the material they are given to play gives the work a decidedly Classical aspect. The motivic imitations of the flute in "O thou that tellest good tidings to Zion" illustrate Mozart's change of the balance between singer and orchestra. Nevertheless, Mozart takes over much of Handel's orchestration verbatim.

Though the changes in instrumentation alter significantly the work's Baroque dialect, there is nothing haphazard or casual in Mozart's approach. On the contrary, the addition of articulations, dynamics, and ornaments to the score indicates that Mozart thought carefully about Handel's music and tried to penetrate its spirit so that he could present it in the best light.

Mozart had neither interest in nor, so far as we know, knowledge of the ways in which Handel's players interpreted musical notation. His *Messiah* is not a scholarly edition; it is an attempt, from the perspective of the late eighteenth century, to render an earlier work intelligible to contemporary performers and audiences.

Mozart's arrangement of *Messiah* might accurately be described as a trope or gloss rather than a translation. Mozart's reading arises partly from the need to present his players with detailed instructions, partly from ambiguities which rendered his source an inadequate guide to performance, and partly from concessions to the late eighteenth-century audience's expectations of variety and structural clarity. It is not surprising that Mozart addressed these needs according to Classical rather than Baroque stylistic premisses, or that some of the changes resulted in a shift away from Baroque drama-turgy and its emphasis on concerto textures. Lacking historical context or a twentieth century concern for authenticity, Mozart cannot be faulted for applying anachronistic and sometimes irrelevant assumptions to Handel's music. Far from being a travesty, however, Mozart's *Messiah* is a respectful attempt to present a work whose outward appearance was deemed "crude" and "much outdated" to an audience schooled in the musical rhetoric of Viennese Classicism. That it preserves much of Handel's music is at least as remarkable as its changes of diction and syntax.

[A thirteen-page handout provided an annotated list of pieces in Randall and Abell score of 1767 and examples of Mozart's additions to "Rejoice greatly," "But thou that didst not leave His soul in hell," "I know that my Redeemer liveth," "O thou that tellest good tidings," "Thou shalt dash them," "Why do the nations," "Behold and see," and "He was despised".]

## The Reception of the Handel-Mozart Messiah in Pre-Victorian England: An Early Manifestation of the "Authentic Performance Practice" Controversy

Steven Norquist, Minneapolis, Minnesota

In 1805, Mozart's accompaniments for Handel's *Messiah* were heard in London for the first time. This conjunction of the two most highly revered composers in the English musical Pantheon touched off a critical controversy about performance practice which extended well into the century. It was acknowledged that Mozart had done his arrangement with skill, and it was agreed that perhaps only Mozart was worthy to undertake such a task. Some argued that only through Mozart's "improvements" had the latent grandeur of Handel's conception been fully realized. But to many British listeners it seemed an unwarranted sacrilege for even so great a master as Mozart to tamper with Handel's music. The attitudes expressed, and the arguments used to support them, strikingly adumbrate the views of protagonists in recent debates over "authenticity." This study outlines polemical positions current from roughly 1810 to 1835, based on an examination of leading musical, social, and literary journals, including the *Harmonicon*, the *Quarterly Musical Magazine* and

continued on page 8

### Handel Calendar

The American Handel Society welcomes news or information about events of interest to Handelian. If possible, please include the address and phone number where readers may obtain details.

**Internationale Händel-Akademie and Händel-Festspiele, Karlsruhe, February 17-29.** Workshop, Symposium, "Handel's Opera Librettos in the Tradition of the Baroque Theater." Performances of *Samson*, *Scipione*, *Imeneo*, *Giulio Cesare*. Int. Akad. & Fest., Baumeisterstr. 11, W-7700 Karlsruhe, Federal Republic of Germany. Tel.: 721-37-65-57.

**Israel in Egypt** (three-part version). Basically Bach, Daniel V. Robinson, Music Director. **February 21**, First United Church, 848 Lake Street, Oak Park; **February 22**, Archbishop Quigley Chapel, 103 E. Chestnut, Chicago; **February 23**, North Shore Congregation Israel, 1185 Sheridan Road, Glencoe. Basically Bach, P.O. Box 479, Chicago, IL 60690, (312) 334-2800.

**Göttinger Händel-Festspiele, June 5-9, 1992.** Symposium, "Handel and European Church Music of his Time." Performances of *Ottone*, Brockes Passion, and Hasse, *Attilio Regolo*. Göttinger Händel-Gesellschaft e.V., Hainholzweg 3-5, W-3400 Göttingen, Federal Republic of Germany, attn: Frau E. M. Starke. 05 51 / 5 67 00.

Norquist from page 7

*Review, the Gentleman's Magazine, and Ackermann's Repository of the Arts.*

A living tradition of the performances of old music survived in London's churches and concert halls to an extent perhaps unknown anywhere on the continent. Handel had remained a mainstay of the repertoire, particularly at the Ancient Concerts, provincial festivals, and "oratorio" concerts. When the century began, a few elderly musicians still remembered Handel's own performances, while many others had been trained by teachers who had lived in Handel's time. Thus performers versed in the Handelian tradition were joined by some whose ideals leaned towards the Mozartean symphonic style, while still others championed a new style of playing, necessary for the scores of Beethoven, Weber, and Rossini. It was natural that conflicts would develop at the intersection of three such contrasting approaches to music making.

Conservative groups and individuals claimed to be preserving the true Handelian tradition, while modernists declared that this tradition and its attendant performance style had atrophied. Advocates of reform argued that modern audiences found older works crude and primitive in their original form. "Improvements" in instrumental technique and construction, the richness of colors available in the modern orchestra, and the increased harmonic sophistication of contemporary listeners were among the reasons most frequently cited as necessitating updating.

Concern with authentic performance is often thought of as a twentieth century development, closely allied with the rise of professional musicology. In this view, the nineteenth century is stigmatized for its supposed penchant for anachronistic performances, engendered by the Handel Commemoration (1784), epitomized by the Victorian choral festivals, and surviving at least into the interpretations of Mengelberg and Beecham. Therefore, it is striking that authentic performance was a vital concern in the early nineteenth century, and that the aesthetic questions involved were avidly discussed.

### Editor's Note

The current issue of the newsletter has been expanded to accommodate the inclusion of the paper abstracts of the 1991 conference session. The board of directors approved the suggestion to publish the abstracts of the annual conference session papers in the newsletter rather than as a separate insert, and this practice will be continued in future years.

In spite of the expanded size of this newsletter, however, most issues largely consist of articles and information provided by the readers. In particular, the Handel Calendar relies on members of the society for information about performances, conferences, workshops, etc., of interest to Handelians. The editor therefore requests that any member who has any item of interest to readers of the newsletter (either an article or information about an event) please submit it to C. Steven LaRue, AHS Newsletter Editor, 1432 N. North Park Avenue, Chicago, IL 60610.

Malmesbury from page 1

located in a converted church, but a new purpose-built facility is under construction. Even now, work can be conducted in agreeable circumstances at Winchester, and the new record office should be yet more attractive.

To assist with the interpretation of the manuscripts from the films, a survey has been undertaken during 1990-91 by Terence Best and myself. The resulting "Guide to the Volumes of the Malmesbury Collection of Handel Manuscripts" is now complete, and a copy has been deposited at Winchester for use with the films. It provides systematic information about the physical structure (by paper gatherings) of each manuscript, with identifications of paper watermarks, classifications and measurements of rastra (stave rulings), and identifications of copyists' hands. Equipped with the films and the guide, the visitor to Winchester should be in a position to make sense of the Malmesbury Collection volumes, and Handelians will benefit from the generosity of the Earl (and the Archives Trust) in making the materials available. Any inquiries about the collection should now be addressed not to the Earl of Malmesbury, but to the County Archivist, Hampshire Record Office, 20 Southgate Street, Winchester, SO23 9EF, Great Britain.

Donald Burrows

### New American Handel Society Officers and Board Members

The officers elected by vote of the American Handel Society membership to serve two-year terms beginning in January 1992 are Graydon Beeks of Pomona College, President; John Roberts of the University of California, Berkeley, Vice-President; and Howard Serwer of the University of Maryland, College Park, Secretary/Treasurer.

Two members of the American Handel Society Board of Directors complete their terms of service this year. They are Shirley Strum Kenny, President of Queens College, City University of New York, a member of the original board and an instrumental force in the success of both the American Handel Society and the Maryland Handel Festival, and Mary Ann Parker, University of Toronto, who served on program committees for the 1990 and 1991 American Handel Society conferences and was chair of the former. Both retire with the thanks of the entire membership for their hard work and leadership.

Three new board members have been appointed to serve in their stead. They are Eleanor Selfridge-Field of the Center for Computer-Assisted Research in the Humanities, William Gudger of the College of Charleston, and C. Steven LaRue of St. James Press in Chicago, who also assumes the job of Newsletter editor beginning with the current issue.



## Board Ratifies Membership Arrangement with Georg-Friedrich-Händel Gesellschaft Dues Increased

At its meeting in Washington, D. C. on November 2, the Board of Directors of the American Handel Society ratified an arrangement with the Georg-Friedrich-Händel Gesellschaft of Halle (Saale) which enables members of the American Handel Society to join the Georg-Friedrich-Händel Gesellschaft through the American Handel Society. The Georg-Friedrich-Händel Gesellschaft is the sponsor for the new edition of Handel's works (*Hallsche Händel-Ausgabe*) and arranges the annual Händel-Festspiele in Halle. Members of the Georg-Friedrich-Händel Gesellschaft receive the *Händel-Jahrbuch*, an annual containing articles in German and English, and notices and circulars from the Georg-Friedrich-Händel Gesellschaft.

The dues for the Georg-Friedrich-Händel Gesellschaft are currently 20 marks (approximately

\$13). In the past, it has been very inconvenient for Americans to join European societies because of the nuisance of purchasing currency from dealers and the very high cost of such small transactions. The American Handel Society maintains a bank account in England which enables it to remit marks to the Georg-Friedrich-Händel Gesellschaft on behalf of its members. This service will be available to American Handel Society members only.

In another action, the Board increased the dues as set forth below. In considering the action, the board noted that there has been no increase in dues since its founding in 1985, and that the cost of operating the society has increased. At the same time, the University of Maryland has found itself unable to support the operation of the society to the extent that it has in the past. By raising the dues, and by prudent management, the board expects the society to remain on a sound financial footing.

Howard Serwer

# The American Handel Society

DEPARTMENT OF MUSIC, UNIVERSITY OF MARYLAND, COLLEGE PARK, MARYLAND 20742 TELEPHONE 301 454-5758

## DIRECTORS AND OFFICERS

Graydon Beeks, *President Elect*  
Pomona College

George Buelow, *Vice President*  
Indiana University

Ellen T. Harris, *President*  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Philip H. Highfill  
The George Washington University

Shirley Strum Kenny  
Queens College, CUNY

\*J. Merrill Knapp  
Princeton, NJ

C. Steven LaRue, *Newsletter Editor*  
Chicago, IL

Lowell E. Lindgren  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Alfred Mann, *Honorary Member*  
Eastman School of Music

Mary Ann Parker  
University of Toronto

John Roberts, *Vice President Elect*  
University of California, Berkeley

\*Howard Serwer, *Secretary/Treasurer*  
University of Maryland, College Park

\*Paul Traver  
University of Maryland, College Park

TERMS BEGINNING JANUARY 1, 1992

William D. Gudger  
The College of Charleston

Eleanor Selfridge-Field  
Sunnyvale, CA

\*Founding member

## APPLICATION FOR MEMBERSHIP IN THE AMERICAN HANDEL SOCIETY

Name \_\_\_\_\_ Date \_\_\_\_\_

Address \_\_\_\_\_

City \_\_\_\_\_ State \_\_\_\_\_ Zip \_\_\_\_\_

*Class of Membership* (for current calendar year, retractive of Jan. 1; else specify future starting year on lines below.)

\_\_\_\_\_ REGULAR .....\$ 20 £ 12

\_\_\_\_\_ DONOR .....\$ 35 £ 20

\_\_\_\_\_ PATRON.....\$125 £ 70

\_\_\_\_\_ SUBSCRIBER .. (Institutions only) .....\$30 £ 18

\_\_\_\_\_ JOINT .... (Married couples; 2 memberships \$25 £ 14  
one set of publications)

\_\_\_\_\_ SPONSOR .....\$60 £ 35

\_\_\_\_\_ LIFE .....\$400 £ 235

Please attach your check payable to THE AMERICAN HANDEL SOCIETY for the amount of your dues and mail to THE AMERICAN HANDEL SOCIETY, Department of Music, University of Maryland, College Park, MD 20742.